\*Algonquin Eco Watch\*Alliance for the Great Lakes\*APT Environment\*Atchafalaya Basinkeeper\*Barrington Area Conservation Trust\*Blanchard River Watershed Partnership\*Blue Water Sportfishing Association\*Canadian Auto Workers-Windsor Regional Environment Council\*Canadian Environmental Law Association\*Citizens Concerned for Michipicoten Bay\*Clean Water Action\*Clean Water Action Alliance of Minnesota\*Committee on the Middle Fork Vermilion River\*Congregation of St. Joseph\*Crop Plus\*Duck Creek Watershed Assembly\*Ducks Unlimited- Great Lakes/Atlantic Region\*Ecojustice\*Environment America\*Environment Illinois\*Environment New York\*Environment Ohio\*Environmental Defenders of McHenry County\*Essex County Field Naturalists' Club\*Fish On II Charters\*Flint River Watershed Coalition\*Forest City Flyfishing Club\*Freshwater Future\*Friends of Big Creek\*Friends of the Mississippi River\*Friends of the Salmon River\*Friends of Wetlands\*Georgian Bay Association\*Great Lakes Environmental Law Center\*Great Lakes Sport Fishermen\*Great Lakes United\*Gulf Restoration Network\*Indiana Wildlife Federation\*Iowa Environmental Council\*Izaak Walton League of America - Minnesota Division\*Izaak Walton League of America - Wisconsin Division\*Izaak Walton League of America- A.D. Sutherland Chapter\*Izaak Walton League of America- Dwight Lydell Chapter\*Izaak Walton League of America- Great Lakes Committee\*Izaak Walton League of America- New York State Division\*Izaak Walton League of America- Ohio Division\*Kalamazoo River Sturgeon for Tomorrow\*Kentucky Waterways Alliance\*Lake Erie Charter Boat Association\*Lake Erie Region Conservancy\*Lake Erie Waterkeeper\*Lake Ontario Trout & Salmon Association\*Land Trust Alliance\*London and District Labour Council- Environment Committee\*Luna Pier Harbour Club\*Michigan Charter Boat Association\*Michigan Environmental Council\*Michigan United Conservation Clubs\*Michigan Wildlife Conservancy\*Midwest Environmental Advocates\*Milwaukee Riverkeeper\*Minnesota B.A.S.S. Federation\*Minnesota Center for Environmental Advocacy\*Minnesota Trout Association\*Minnesota Trout Unlimited\*Missouri Coalition for the Environment\*National Parks Conservation Association\*National Wildlife Federation\*Natural Resources Defense Council\*Nature Abounds\*Nature Center at Shaker Lakes\*New York League of Conservation Voters\*Ohio Environmental Council\*Ontario Shorewalk Association\*Ottawa Riverkeeper\*Pelican River Watershed District\*Pentwater Sportfishing Association\*Prairie Rivers Network\*Quinte Conservation\*River Alliance of Wisconsin\*River Network\*Rock River Coalition\*Salmon Unlimited of Illinois\*Save Lake Superior Association\*Save the Dunes\*Save The River\*Shaker Lakes Garden Club\*Sierra Club Ontario\*Sierra Club-Binational Great Lakes Committee\*Sisters of St. Francis of Penance and Christian Charity\*St. Clair Region Conservation Authority\*St. Louis River Alliance\*Stray Cat Charter Fishing\*Tennessee Clean Water Network\* The Lake Huron Centre for Coastal Conservation\*Thunder Bay Salmon Association\*Tip of the Mitt Watershed Council\*Toronto and Region Conservation Authority\*Town and Country Resource Conservation and Development\*Trollers Unlimited\*Upper Peninsula Environmental Coalition\*Upper Thames River Conservation Authority\*Vera Cruz Yacht Club\*Welland River Keepers\*Wisconsin Great Lakes Coalition\*Wisconsin Lakes \*Wisconsin Land & Water Conservation Association\*Wisconsin Wildlife Federation\*

March 31, 2011

Mr. David Wethington U.S. Army Corps of Engineers 111 North Canal Street, 6th Floor Chicago, IL 60606

Re: Notice of Intent to Prepare a Draft Environmental Impact Statement (EIS), Initiate the Public Scoping Period and Host Public Scoping Meetings for the Great Lakes and Mississippi River Interbasin Study (GLMRIS)

Dear Mr. Wethington,

Please accept these comments submitted on behalf of the following 108 organizations, as well as our hundreds of thousands of members across the Great Lakes, St. Lawrence and Mississippi River basins, in both the United States and Canada, regarding the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers

(Corps), Chicago District's Notice of Intent to Prepare a Draft Environmental Impact Statement (EIS), Initiate the Public Scoping Period and Host Public Scoping Meetings for the Great Lakes and Mississippi River Interbasin Study (GLMRIS). We represent environmental, conservation, fishing, boating, labour and religious groups with a shared interest in preventing the ecological and economic harm caused by aquatic invasive species.

The undersigned organizations are extremely concerned about an Asian carp invasion to the international waters of the Great Lakes and St. Lawrence River, as well as concerned about the two-way transfer of aquatic invaders between the Mississippi and Great Lakes basins. We are submitting specific recommendations to improve GLMRIS and ensure the ecologic and economic health of these great basins is protected from damaging aquatic nuisance species.

# Prevent Aquatic Nuisance Species (ANS) Transfer

The GLMRIS study was authorized by the U.S. Congress in 2007 to "prevent" rather than "reduce the risk" of aquatic nuisance species movement between the Great Lakes and Mississippi River basin<sup>1</sup>. In other words, Congress requires the Corps to only be developing solutions that are 100% effective and it is beyond the scope of the Corps' statutory authorization for the GLMRIS study to look at any solutions that would not achieve prevention.

We believe the only permanent and sustainable solution to the Asian carp threat to the Great Lakes, and the threat of future movement of invasives, is the hydrologic separation of the Great Lakes and the Mississippi River basin because if water does not flow between the two watersheds, water-based plants, animals and diseases will not be able to migrate actively or passively. The Corps has inappropriately broadened GLMRIS to study "risk reduction" <sup>2</sup> which is neither what Congress told them to do, nor a credible strategy to prevent ANS movement through the Chicago Area Waterway System (CAWS) or any of the other aquatic connections. Short-term, emergency activities have already been authorized around the CAWS and in Eagle Marsh, Indiana, and funded separately from GLMRIS. We support these emergency activities. However, expanding the scope of GLMRIS to address risk reduction will divert resources from determining how to achieve prevention as fast as possible.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Water Resources Development Act of 2007 ("2007 WRDA"), Pub. L. No. 110-114, § 3061(d) (2007) says: (d) Feasibility Study- The Secretary, in consultation with appropriate Federal, State, local, and nongovernmental entities, shall conduct, at Federal expense, a feasibility study of the range of options and technologies available to *prevent* the spread of aquatic nuisance species between the Great Lakes and Mississippi River Basins through the Chicago Sanitary and Ship Canal and other aquatic pathways

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> U.S. Army Corps of Engineers ("USACE"), *Project Management Plan: Great Lakes and Mississippi River Basin Interbasin Feasibility Study* 1 (2010), and U.S. Army Engineer Division, Great Lakes and Ohio River ("CELRD"), USACE, *Memorandum for Record* ¶ 2, dated December 15, 2010, available at: <u>http://glmris.anl.gov/documents/docs/GLMRIS\_prevent\_whitepaper.pdf</u>

# **Produce Results Before 2015**

The GLMRIS study takes too long. The Chicago portion of the study is not predicted to be complete until mid-2015, over four years from now. Corps staff indicated in at least one public meeting that this official timeline is optimistic and the actual end date is likely to be even later. The Corps should acknowledge the urgency of finding a permanent solution, narrow the scope of investigation to hydrological separation, condense the timeline and produce final results for the Chicago portion of GLMRIS within 18 months rather than mid-2015.

Further, additional study requirements in GLMRIS, such as a review of all invasive species that could move between the two basins, should not extend the study timeline and should not influence the mandate to "prevent" aquatic invasive species movement between the two basins.

# **Prioritize Solutions for the Chicago Area**

The obvious and critical threat of Asian carp establishing in the Great Lakes is a reason for urgent action. The Corps should study and provide a solution for the CAWS as the first priority, and where needed, act on other aquatic pathways, based on the greatest likelihood of invasion. If necessary, the Corps should consider a phased approach to separating the two watersheds, prioritizing measures to prevent Asian carp migration while still taking steps that will lead to permanent prevention of all movement of aquatic nuisance species in both directions.

# **Integrate Relevant Research into GLMRIS**

In order to accelerate the time frame of the study and save resources, the Corps should not duplicate relevant work that has already been done or is currently being performed. The Corps should integrate the scientific results from the binational risk assessment of Asian carp being facilitated by the Great Lakes Fishery Commission, and the identification of hydrological separation options being developed by the Great Lakes Commission and the Great Lakes-St. Lawrence Cities Initiative into GLMRIS, after an independent critical review.

#### **Provide for Public Review and Input**

The Corps should create an opportunity for regular discussion forums during which the public can interact with technical staff and consultants for detailed questions and answers on the progress of GLMRIS. We recommend forums held at least two times a year, in addition to the requirements of the NEPA process.

#### **Request Hearing in Canada**

An Asian carp invasion to the Great Lakes is not just a threat to Americans; it presents a serious threat to the health and welfare of Canadians. Approximately 40 percent of the shoreline of the Great Lakes and 36 percent of their waters lie within the boundaries of Ontario, Canada. The majority of the St. Lawrence River basin is in Québéc, Canada. A risk assessment study conducted by the Canadian Department of Fisheries and Oceans concluded that if Asian carp successfully colonize the Great Lakes there is a high probability they would spread across the

Great Lakes basin and possibly even through the prairie provinces.<sup>3</sup> The study stresses that such an invasion would have a significant impact on the food web and trophic structure of aquatic systems. Furthermore, the Ontario government has stated that if Asian carp enters the Great Lakes there will be serious adverse impacts on Ontario's recreational and commercial fisheries, which are valued at approximately CAD\$400 million per year.<sup>4</sup> Environment Canada has made a similar assessment.<sup>5</sup>

In 2010 four not-for profit organizations in Canada requested the U.S. Secretary of State to formally request a public hearing in Canada regarding Asian carp as an international pollution threat, under section 310(a) of the *Clean Water Act.*<sup>6</sup> A response to this petition was never received. The Department of State should request that Foreign Affairs host a public meeting in Canada where the Corps study team would be invited to hear comments from stakeholders in Canada who are concerned with the impact of an Asian carp invasion to shared international waters.

In summary, our organizations strongly encourage the Corps to adhere to the Congressional authority to "prevent" the spread of aquatic nuisance species between the Great Lakes and Mississippi River basins and not "reduce the risk"; accelerate the timeline for completion of GLMRIS; prioritize the CAWS portion of GLMRIS; provide for public comment as the study proceeds; and request a hearing in Canada.

Thank you for the opportunity to comment, and for seriously engaging in this study, which is critical to the health of the Great Lakes-St. Lawrence River and Mississippi River basins in both the United States and Canada. If you have any questions please do not hesitate to contact Jennifer Nalbone, Director, Navigation and Invasive Species for Great Lakes United at phone: (716) 213-0408 or email: jen@glu.org.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Department of Fisheries and Ocean Canada (Canadian Science Advisory Secretariat), *Risk Assessment for Asian Carp in Canada*. Department of Fisheries and Ocean Canada., 2009), at 19 – 27.
<sup>4</sup> Brief of Amicus Curiae Her Majesty The Queen In Right of Ontario in Support of the State of

Michigan's Motion For a Preliminary Injunction (31 December 2009).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Environment Canada, *Invasive Alien Species of the Month* (Environment Canada, undated), available at <<u>http://www.ec.gc.ca/eee-ias/default.asp?lang=En&n=8E8C2C22-1</u>>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Petition on behalf of the Waterkeepers Alliance, Great Lakes United, Environmental Defence Canada and Georgian Bay Forever to the U.S. Secretary of State and to the Administrator of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency concerning s. 310 of the *Clean Water Act*. May 2010

#### Sincerely,

Mike Wilton President Algonquin Eco Watch Spring Bay, Ontario POP 2B0

Joel Brammeier President and CEO Alliance for the Great Lakes Chicago, Illinois, 60602

Susan Bryant Coordinator APT Environment Elmira, Ontario N3B 1K9

Leigh Haynie Staff Attorney Atchafalaya Basinkeeper Baton Rouge, Louisiana 70806

Karen Yancey Executive Director Barrington Area Conservation Trust Barrington, Illinois 60010

Timothy P. Brugeman President Blanchard River Watershed Partnership Findlay Ohio 45840

Judy Ogden Vice-President Blue Water Sportfishing Association Port Huron, Michigan 48061

Mark Bartlett President Canadian Auto Workers-Windsor Regional Environment Council Windsor, Ontario, N8W 4J1

Sarah Miller Co-ordinator and Water Policy Researcher Canadian Environmental Law Association Toronto, Ontario M5V 2L4

Mark Z. Leschishin President Citizens Concerned for Michipicoten Bay Wawa, Ontario POS 1K0

Susan E. Harley, J.D. Michigan Policy Director Clean Water Action East Lansing, Michigan 48823 Darrell Gerber Program Coordinator Clean Water Action Alliance of Minnesota Minneapolis, Minnesota 55414

Sandra Bales Director Committee on the Middle Fork Vermilion River Urbana, Illinois 61801

Joellen Sbrissa Peace and Justice Team Congregation of St. Joseph La Grange Park, Illinois 60526-1721

Diane Holfner Founder Crop Plus Portland, New York, 14757

Glenn Hayden Chair Duck Creek Watershed Assembly Whitehall, Michigan 49461

Becky Humphries Director Ducks Unlimited- Great Lakes/Atlantic Region Ann Arbor, Michigan 48108

Hugh Wilkins Staff Lawyer Ecojustice Toronto, Ontario M4W 3X8

Anna Aurilio Director, Washington DC Office Environment America Washington, DC 20003

Max Muller Program Director Environment Illinois Chicago, Illinois 60661

Eric Whalen Field Organizer Environment New York New York, New York, 10018

Julian Boggs Program Associate Environment Ohio Columbus, Ohio 43215

Ciynthia Skrukrud Chair, Water Resources Protection Committee Environmental Defenders of McHenry County Woodstock, Illinois 60098 Teresa Austrin Treasurer Essex County Field Naturalists' Club Essex County, Ontario N8X 5B5

Eddie McMillion Captain Fish On II Charters LaSalle, Michigan 48184

Rebecca Fedewa Executive Director Flint River Watershed Coalition Flint, Michigan 48502

Andy Roefs Past President Forest City Flyfishing Club London, Ontario N6A 5L7

Cheryl Mendoza Associate Director Freshwater Future Spring Lake, Michigan 49456

Mary Ellen Stasek Chairman Friends of Big Creek Cleveland, Ohio 44109

Whitney Clark Executive Director Friends of the Mississippi River Saint Paul, Minnesota 55101

Susan Moore President Friends of the Salmon River Tamworth, Ontario, K0K 3G0

Ray Stewart President and Director of Communications Friends of Wetlands Amherst, Ohio 44001-1437

John Wilson Chair, Fisheries Committee Georgian Bay Association Toronto, Ontario M4K 3H3

Nick Schroeck Executive Director Great Lakes Environmental Law Center Detroit, Michigan 48202

Steve Franke President Great Lakes Sport Fishermen Milwaukee Wisconsin 53203 Jennifer Nalbone Director, Navigation and Invasive Species Great Lakes United Amherst, New York 14226

Matt Rota Science & Water Policy Director Gulf Restoration Network New Orleans, Louisiana 70176

Barbara Simpson Executive Director Indiana Wildlife Federation Indianapolis, Indiana 46077

Marian Riggs Gelb Executive Director Iowa Environmental Council Des Moines, Iowa 50309

George Guyant President Izaak Walton League of America - Wisconsin Division Amherst Jct., Wisconsin 54407-9073

Roland Schmidt State Director Izaak Walton League of America- A.D. Sutherland Chapter Fond du Lac, Wisconsin 54935

Robert Stegmier Conservation Chair Izaak Walton League of America- Dwight Lydell Chapter Belmont, Michigan 49306

Jill Crafton Chair Izaak Walton League of America- Great Lakes Committee Bloomington, Minnesota 55438-1945

Conrad Strozik President Izaak Walton League of America- New York State Division Cazenovia, New York 13035

Curt Leitz President Izaak Walton League of America - Minnesota Division Duluth, Minnesota 55805

James D. Storer President Izaak Walton League of America- Ohio Division Willoughby, Ohio 44094

Suzanne Dixon Board Secretary Kalamazoo River Sturgeon for Tomorrow Fennville, Michigan 49408 Judy Petersen Executive Director Kentucky Waterways Alliance Louisville, Kentucky 40206

Rick Unger President Lake Erie Charter Boat Association Cleveland, Ohio 44101

Tom Fuhrman President Lake Erie Region Conservancy Erie, PA 16546

Sandy Bihn Executive Director Lake Erie Waterkeeper Toledo, Ohio 43618

Patrick J DiNicola Treasure Lake Ontario Trout & Salmon Association Getzville, New York 14068

Erin Heskett Midwest Director Land Trust Alliance Portage, Michigan 49002

Jim Mahon Chair London and District Labour Council- Environment Committee London, Ontario N6B 3P6

Michael E. Briskey General Manager Luna Pier Harbour Club Luna Pier, Michigan 48157

Captain Denny Grinold State and Federal Governmental Affairs Michigan Charter Boat Association Lansing, Michigan 48908

James Clift Policy Director Michigan Environmental Council Lansing, Michigan 48912

Erin McDonough Executive Director Michigan United Conservation Clubs Lansing, Michigan 48912

Dennis Fijalkowski Executive Director Michigan Wildlife Conservancy Bath, Michigan 48808 Kimberlee Wright Executive Director Midwest Environmental Advocates Madison, Wisconsin 53703

Cheryl Nenn Riverkeeper Milwaukee Riverkeeper Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53202

Mickey Goetting Conservation Director Minnesota B.A.S.S. Federation Minneapolis, Minnesota 55379

Scott Strand Executive Director Minnesota Center for Environmental Advocacy St. Paul, Minnesota 55101

Jeffrey S. Broberg President Minnesota Trout Association Rochester, Minnesota 55904

John P. Lenczewski Executive Director Minnesota Trout Unlimited Chanhassen, Minnesota 55317

Kat Logan Smith Executive Director Missouri Coalition for the Environment St. Louis, Missouri 63130

Lynn McClure Midwest Regional Director National Parks Conservation Association Chicago, Illinois 60603

Andy Buchsbaum Regional Executive Director, Great Lakes Office National Wildlife Federation Ann Arbor, Michigan 48104

Thomas Cmar Midwest Program Attorney Natural Resources Defense Council Chicago, Illinois 60606

Melinda Hughes-Wert President Nature Abounds Clearfield, Pennsylvania 16830

David Wright Outreach & Audience Development Nature Center at Shaker Lakes Cleveland, Ohio 44120 Marcia Bystryn President New York League of Conservation Voters New York, New York 10004

Keith Dimoff Executive Director Ohio Environmental Council Columbus, Ohio 43212

Betty Van Osch President Ontario Shorewalk Association Ridgeway, Ontario, Canada LOS 1N0

Meredith Brown Riverkeeper Ottawa Riverkeeper Ottawa, Ontario K2A 0E1

Tera L. Guetter Administrator Pelican River Watershed District Detroit Lakes, Minnesota 56501

Ms. Lyn Snider President Pentwater Sportfishing Association Pentwater, Michigan 49449

Glynnis Collins Executive Director Prairie Rivers Network Champaign, Illinois 61820

Brad McNevin Regulations Officer/Fisheries Biologist Quinte Conservation Belleville, Ontario K8N 4Z2

Denny Caneff Executive Director River Alliance of Wisconsin Madison, Wisconsin 53703

Todd Ambs President River Network Portland, Oregon 97204

Scott Taylor President Rock River Coalition Jefferson, Wisconsin 53549

James Nelligan President Salmon Unlimited of Illinois Lemont Illinois 60439 Le Lind President Save Lake Superior Association Two Harbors, Minnesota 55616

Nicole Kamins Executive Director Save the Dunes Michigan City, Indiana 46360

Jennifer Caddick Executive Director Save The River Clayton, NY 13624

Anne Ginn President Shaker Lakes Garden Club Cleveland, Ohio 44118

Mary Muter, Chair, Great Lakes Section Sierra Club Ontario King City, Ontario L7B 1J9

Wayne Howard and Lino Grima Co-Chairs Sierra Club-Binational Great Lakes Committee Rochester, New York 14623

Sister Dorothy Mueller, osf Provincial Minister Sisters of St. Francis of Penance and Christian Charity, Holy Name Province Stella Niagara, New York 14144

Muriel Andreae Biologist St. Clair Region Conservation Authority Strathroy, Ontario N7G 3P9

Julene Boe Executive Director St. Louis River Alliance Duluth, Minnesota 55802

Captain John Giszczak President Stray Cat Charter Fishing Luna Pier, Michigan 48157

Renée Hoyos Executive Director Tennessee Clean Water Network Knoxville, Tennessee 37901

Geoff Peach Coastal Resources Manager The Lake Huron Centre for Coastal Conservation Goderich, Ontario N7A 1P9 Doug Lund President Thunder Bay Salmon Association Thunder Bay, Ontario P7E 6K1

Gail Gruenwald Executive Director Tip of the Mitt Watershed Council Petoskey, Michigan 49770

Christine Tu Supervisor, Aquatic Systems Toronto and Region Conservation Authority Toronto, Ontario M3N 1S4

Lisa Conley President Town and Country Resource Conservation and Development Jefferson, Wisconsin 53549

Emil Liebewein President Trollers Unlimited Palos Park, Illinois 60464

William Malmsten President Upper Penninsula Environmental Coalition Houghton, Michigan 49931 Cathy Reeves Aquatic Biology Technician Upper Thames River Conservation Authority London, Ontario N5V 5B9

Amy Hueber Commodore Emeritus Vera Cruz Yacht Club Mexico, New York 13115

David Quinlan Vice Chairman Welland River Keepers Welland, Ontario, Canada L3C 4V9

James Te Selle President Wisconsin Great Lakes Coalition Oostburg, Wisconsin 53070

Karen von Huene Executive Director Wisconsin Lakes Madison, Wisconsin 53705

Julian Zelazny Executive Director Wisconsin Land & Water Conservation Association Madison, Wisconsin 53701

George Meyer Executive Director Wisconsin Wildlife Federation Madison, Wisconsin, 53717